DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 099 270 SO 007 966

AUTHOR Rivas, Frank W.
TITLE An Assessment of Attitudes Toward Music. National Assessment of Educational Progress.
INSTITUTION Education Commission of the States, Denver, Colo. National Assessment of Educational Progress.
REPORT NO 03-MU-03
PUB DATE Sep 74
NOTE 41p.; ED 063 197; So 007 842, So 007 843 are related documents
AVAILABLE FROM Superintendent of Documents, U.S. Government Printing Office, Washington, D.C. 20402 ($0.85)

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.75 HC-$1.85 PLUS POSTAGE
DESCRIPTORS *Aesthetic Education; *Educational Assessment; Educational Research; Evaluation; Group Activities; Music; Music Activities; Musical Instruments; *Music Appreciation; *Music Education; National Surveys; Singing; *Student Attitudes; Vocal Music
IDENTIFIERS National Assessment of Educational Progress

ABSTRACT

Reactions to attitude items from the first national assessment of music expressed by a panel of music educators during a two-day conference on implications of the entire assessment are reproduced in this report. The panel states that aesthetic sensitivity is the ultimate goal of music education; however, the attitude items in the assessment do not measure sensitivity directly but measure "approach tendencies" which correlate to some degree with sensitivity. Six questions expanded upon in the assessment are: 1) How often do you seek out and listen to music that you like to hear on television, radio, records, or tapes? 2) How often do you attend live musical programs outside of school? 3) Are there any kinds of music that you like to listen to? 4) Do you like to sing? 5) Can you play a musical instrument? 6) What are your reactions to singing and playing an instrument in small and large groups? National statistics pertinent to each question and reactions from the music panel are presented. The same exercises are then analyzed according to region, sex, color, parental education, and community type. Concluding remarks are made by the panel about the usefulness of the data for education decision making. (JH)

AN ASSESSMENT OF ATTITUDES TOWARD MUSIC

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

ED 099270

SP007966

NATIONAL ASSESSMENT OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRESS

A Project of the Education Commission of the States

David Hall, Governor of Oklahoma, Chairman, Education Commission of the States
Wendell H. Pierce, Executive Director, Education Commission of the States
J. Stanley Ahmann, Director, National Assessment

Assessment Reports

Science, 1969-70

1	National Results	July 1970
4	Results by sex, region and size of community	April 1971
7	Results by color, parental education, size and type of community; balanced results	May 1973

Citizenship, 1969-70

2	National Results	November 1970
6	Results by sex, region and size of community	July 1971
9	Results by color, parental education, size and type of community	May 1972

Writing, 1969-70

3	National Results	November 1970
5	Results by sex, region and size of community	April 1971
8	Writing Mechanics	February 1972
10	Selected Essays and Letters	November 1972
11	Results by color, parental education, size and type of community, sex and region for objectively scored exercises	May 1973
02-GIY	General Information Yearbook—A description of National Assessment's methodology, with special attention given to Reading and Literature	May 1972

Reading, 1970-71

02-R-01	Understanding Words and Word Relationships	April 1973
02-R-02	Graphic Materials	June 1973
02-R-03	Written Directions	May 1973
02-R-04	Reference Materials	July 1973
02-R-05	Gleaning Significant Facts From Passages	May 1973
02-R-06	Main Ideas and Organization	July 1973
02-R-07	Drawing Inferences	August 1973
02-R-08	Critical Reading	May 1973
02-R-09	Reading Rate and Comprehension	December 1972
02-R-20	Released Exercises	July 1973
02-R-30	Recipes, Wrappers, Reasoning and Rate: A Digest of the First Reading Assessment	April 1974
02-R-00	Summary Data	July 1974

Literature, 1970-71

02-L-01	Understanding Imaginative Language	March 1973
02-L-02	Responding to Literature	April 1973
02-L-03	Recognizing Literary Works and Characters	April 1973
02-L-04	A Survey of Reading Habits	May 1973
02-L-20	Released Exercises	April 1973
02-L-00	Summary Data	June 1973

Social Studies, 1971-72

03-SS-01	Political Knowledge and Attitudes	December 1973
03-SS-02	Contemporary Social Issues	July 1974
03-SS-00	The First Social Studies Assessment: An Overview	June 1974

Music, 1971-72

03-MU-01	The First National Assessment of Musical Performance	February 1974
03-MU-02	A Perspective on the First Music Assessment	April 1974
03-MU-03	An Assessment of Attitudes Toward Music	September 1974
03-MU-00	The First Music Assessment: An Overview	August 1974

ED 097270

NATIONAL ASSESSMENT OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRESS

A Project of the Education Commission of the States

AN ASSESSMENT OF ATTITUDES TOWARD MUSIC

Music Report No. 03-MU-03

September 1974

For sale by the Superintendent of Documents, U.S. Government Printing Office, Washington, D.C. 20402

NATIONAL ASSESSMENT OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRESS

J. Stanley Ahmann
Director

George H. Johnson
Associate Director

This report was written by Frank W. Rivas of
National Assessment's Utilization/Applications Department.
It was edited for technical accuracy by Sue Oldefendt of the
Research and Analysis Department.

Staff support was provided by:
Operations Department
Exercise Development Department
Research and Analysis Department
Utilization/Applications Department
Data Processing Department
Communications Department (ECS)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION v

CHAPTER 1 The Exercises 1

CHAPTER 2 Group Differences 17

Region 17

Sex 21

Color 23

Parental Education 25

Community Type 27

CHAPTER 3 Conclusions 29

INTRODUCTION

"Most, almost all, individuals have some favorable attitudes toward music. These positive attitudes, however, are in some ways superficial. Although many individuals are willing to 'mess around' with music, few are willing to make a commitment to it."

Thus a panel of music educators reacted to the attitude items in the first national assessment of music. The panelists, chosen by the National Executive Board of the Music Educators National Conference, met early in 1974 to discuss the implications of the entire music assessment. The panelists included Paul Lehman, co-chairman, Jo Ann Baird, William English, Richard Graham, Charles Hoffer and Sally Monsour.[1] National

It is important that students be favorably disposed toward music, and it is important that they be favorably disposed toward a variety of kinds of music. It is important that they learn that music can be a source of satisfaction and enjoyment in their lives. It's not important that they learn to like the kinds of music that the teacher likes or that they like any particular kind of music or that they can play an instrument or engage in any single kind of musical activity.

[1] Paul R. Lehman is professor of music education at the Eastman School of Music, University of Rochester. Dr. Lehman has served as chairman of the MENC National Commission on Instruction since its creation in 1971. He is currently a member of the Editorial Committee of the *Journal of Research in Music Education* and serves as book review editor for that journal. Dr. Lehman is also the author of *Tests and Measurement in Music.*

Jo Ann C. Baird, general music specialist with the Boulder (Colorado) Valley Schools, is 1974-76 national chairman of the MENC Public Relations Advisory Committee. Her professional experience has included teaching instrumental, vocal and general music, supervising student teachers and presenting numerous professional workshops.

William S. English is professor of music and chairman of the Division of Music Education at Arizona State University. He has conducted several published empirical studies of music education and is an associate editor of the *Journal of Research in Music Education.*

Richard M. Graham is professor of music at the University of Georgia, where he is also director of the Music Therapy Program. He has published research on the psychology of music and authored *Music for Exceptional Children.*

Charles R. Hoffer is professor of music at Indiana University, where he is in charge of the graduate music education program. Dr. Hoffer has written *Teaching Music in the Secondary Schools* and five other books on music and music education. He is also president of the Indiana Music Educators Association.

Sally A. Monsour is professor of music education and coordinator of graduate studies in music at

Assessment participants included Frank Rivas, co-chairman, and Susan Oldefendt.

Because of the paramount importance of the affective domain in music education, the panel devoted much of their attention to the attitude items. Aesthetic sensitivity, the educators pointed out, is the ultimate goal of music education. Although the attitude items do not measure sensitivity directly, they do measure approach tendencies which we can assume correlate to some degree with sensitivity.

A discussion of the importance of attitudes in music education was opened by Paul Lehman with the following statement: "It is important that students be favorably disposed toward music, and it is important that they be favorably disposed toward a variety of kinds of music. It is important that they learn that music can be a source of satisfaction and enjoyment in their lives. It's not important that they learn to like the kinds of music that the teacher likes or that they like any particular kind of music or that they can play an instrument or engage in any single kind of musical activity. But it is important that they develop approach behaviors toward music."

While there was general agreement with Lehman's statement, other panelists augmented it in several ways.

Charles Hoffer stressed the interrelationship between the affective and cognitive domains, pointing out that students cannot be taught to be favorably disposed toward music. He quoted Harry Broudy's phrase "enlightened cherishing" to emphasize the close relationship between the cognitive and affective domains. "Connoisseurship or enlightened cherishing," theorized Broudy, "requires aesthetic judgment, for it is in aesthetic judgment that we not only know what we like, but can also make some attempt at giving reasons for liking it."[2]

Richard Graham underscored Hoffer's remarks: "We are in trouble if we think too much of the affective domain because nothing is learned totally affectively."

The group also felt that some discussion of the terms *attitude, affective* and *aesthetic* would be necessary in defining the scope of the music assessment.

Affective is the broadest term. In one definition, for example, the affective domain includes areas designated as receiving (attending), responding, valuing, organizing and characterizing by a value or value complex.[3] Paul Lehman pointed out that most school music programs do not ever deal with all aspects of the affective domain. Goals for receiving, for example, are largely expected to take place before formal education begins, while characterization by a value or value complex does not normally occur until after formal education ends.

Attitude, as measured by the National Assessment exercises, is only a small portion of the entire affective domain. The exercises generally fall into the areas that Krathwohl, Bloom and Masia would classify as willingness to respond and acceptance of a value, what the panelists often referred to as approach tendencies.

Even in this delimited area, the panelists were quick to point out, the assessment measures were not and could not be direct. Dick Graham: "It is important to measure success in the affective domain, but we haven't measured it. Instead, we have used indirect indicators of approach responses to music." These indirect measures, the educators stressed, are important. For one thing,

---

Georgia State University. A member of the Editorial Committee of the *Journal of Research in Music Education*, she has authored or co-authored nine books on music education, including *Music in Open Education*. Dr. Monsour was unable to attend the second session, which focused on the attitude items, but did send in several written comments.

[2] Harry S. Broudy, "The Case for Aesthetic Education," in *Documentary Report of the Tanglewood Symposium*, ed. Robert A. Choate (Washington: Music Educators National Conference, 1968), p. 10.

[3] David R. Krathwohl, Benjamin S. Bloom and Bertram 3. Masia, *Taxonomy & Educational Objectives: The Classification of Educational Goals. Handbook II: Affective Domain* (New York: David McKay, 1964).

they are all we have, since at this time direct measures of attitude are impossible. Second, they can be assumed to correlate with actual attitudes.

Finally, the panel emphasized that aesthetic sensitivity—not just positive attitudes—were the ultimate goal of music education.

Dick Graham: "It's quite possible that an individual can have positive attitudes toward music, yet fail to have a real aesthetic experience. A good teacher can make his students love learning, and a good student might be able to recite the sharps and flats and the years of Beethoven's compositions faster than anyone—and love it—yet still fail to respond aesthetically."

William English: "The expectation of the learning environment is basically what determines what will happen. Thus, if the expectation is aesthetic, the outcome will be aesthetic. If the expectation is social or intellectual, then the outcome will most likely be social or intellectual. The expectation of all presentations of music should be aesthetic. Facts, figures, numbers and skills are only means to an end."

The aesthetic experience is, of course, difficult to define. It is one type of peak experience, but, the group emphasized, not all peak experiences—even with music—are aesthetic. An aesthetic experience does involve an interaction between feeling and thinking, but the reader is referred elsewhere for a more lengthy discussion of the aesthetic experience.[4]

The group thus maintained that generalizing from the relatively narrow base of the assessment exercises to the broad expanse of the affective domain should be done with great caution. They suggested that the following caveats should be kept in mind while interpreting the results:

1. The assessment results are based on a random sample of entire populations regardless of musical background or preparation. The data provide valuable insight into the musical competence of the "average" citizen; however, a study of persons with some degree of training or interest in music would presumably produce quite different findings.
2. Not all musical attitudes are directly attributable to formal instruction in schools. Television, radio and social environments play major roles in developing musical knowledge as well as in influencing musical tastes and attitudes. Thus, the ability of the music teacher to influence attitudes is limited.

The panel concluded that the attitude items represent an important beginning in a continuing effort to secure objective data for educational decision making. They felt that the data do have significant implications for music educators. The group pointed out that assessment findings have been corroborated by several other studies, notably those by the American Music Conference and by the National Research Center of the Arts.

[4]See, for example, Gerald L. Knieter, "The Nature of Aesthetic Education" in *Toward an Aesthetic Education* (Washington: Music Educators National Conference, 1971), pp. 3-19.

CHAPTER 1
THE EXERCISES

There are a lot of people who would like to play instruments, who agree that playing instruments and singing are fun. We simply don't have the mechanism to teach them. If you want to start as a beginner, there are practically no high schools where you can do that. There is no opportunity to start if you don't start when the whole group starts and follow along in a lock-step pattern, joining bands, orchestras and so on.

Only six exercises that measure interest in or attitudes toward music have been released.[1] Each of these exercises—along with the national results—are displayed in this section of the report. After each exhibit is a summary of the panel's reactions to the exercise.

All assessment exercises were read aloud to minimize reading problems that the participants might have. Some of the attitude exercises were administered to groups of 12, while others were administered to individuals. Individually administered exercises are noted in the text.

All exercises have a two-character designation. The first digit indicates the topic (all the exercises in this volume begin with a "5" for attitude), while the second indicates both its position within the topic and whether the exercise is released. Position is alphabetical (5A comes before 5D); released exercises are referred to by capital letters, while unreleased exercises have the corresponding lowercase designation. Since the exercises have the same designation in the statistical report,[2] the reader can quickly turn to that report to find more detailed information about any of the exercises discussed in this volume.

Before studying the results, the panelists made two criticisms of Exercise 5A.

First, William English pointed out that the device with which people listen to music is not too important: "Who cares whether they listen on television, radio, records or tapes, as long as they listen?" Paul Lehman added that there was no directionality in the various parts: "Is it better to listen to music on television or radio? On radio or on records? Nevertheless, the panelists generally agreed that naming specific media probably increased the validity of the item. If the items had simply asked whether individuals

---

[1] Approximately half of the Music items have not been released so that they can be used—without fear of contamination—to measure change in the second Music assessment.

[2] *The First Music Assessment: A Statistical Report, Music Report 03-MU-20* (in press).

EXERCISE 5A

How often do you seek out and listen to music that you like to hear on each of the following?

	Age Level			
	9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
A. Television				
○ Less than once a month	3%	9%	15%	22%
○ 1 to 3 times a month	4	12	13	14
○ Once a week	9	20	21	32
○ 2 to 6 times a week	10	25	24	19
○ Every day	73	35	27	13
B. Radio				
○ Less than once a month	8	4	1	4
○ 1 to 3 times a month	9	4	1	3
○ Once a week	17	8	4	6
○ 2 to 6 times a week	20	26	18	18
○ Every day	44	59	76	69
C. Records or tapes				
○ Less than once a month	15	11	6	21
○ 1 to 3 times a month	14	13	9	15
○ Once a week	21	16	13	18
○ 2 to 6 times a week	23	33	32	28
○ Every day	25	28	41	17

listened to music, the question would have been too vague to be meaningful.

Second, Charles Hoffer noted that "listening to music" can mean a great variety of things: "When interpreting the data, I think we should assume that listening means just turning on switches, even if the individuals have no idea of what is being played. But that's far from what we as music educators mean by listening."

Paul Lehman: "That's especially true on television because there are virtually no music programs as such on the medium."

Jo Ann Baird: "That might account for the lower percentages at the adult level. Adults might have interpreted *listen* more strictly."

Although there was general agreement that *listening* could be variously interpreted, Dick Graham maintained that listening to music at any level is valuable: "Some music educators have been rather disturbed by the casual way in which individuals, especially adolescents, listen to music. I think when you consider the casual nature of popular music that the very little bit of effort they put forth is about what the music deserves . . . . We shouldn't interpret listening to music too narrowly. Listening to music, hearing music, being in the presence of music, the need to talk about music, all these levels are important."

The panelists found the results very encouraging. The results reflect strong approach tendencies to music and reflect the importance that music plays in our culture. They also noted that participation in these media increases from ages 9 to 13, from ages 13 to 17, but then decreases at the adult level. Charles Hoffer: "For a number of reasons, music has been used by adolescents and teen-agers as a means of social identification. Every teenager who wants to be a member of the peer group simply must be conversant with popular or youth music."

These data, the group agreed, reflect not only serious listening but the broad array of behaviors which Dick Graham mentioned.

The educators pointed out that Exercise 5D measures a variety of nonmusical variables such as the socioeconomic condition of the respondents, which might encourage listening at home rather than attending concerts, and the availability of live musical programs, a great problem in rural and less urban areas, in addition to an approach behavior to music. The educators were surprised by the high percentages that did claim to attend live musical programs, especially in a time when recorded music is so available. They suggested that the high percentages at the 17-year-old level were probably due to the important role of music in the social life of young people.

Jo Ann Baird: "I think the big implication is that school music programs are important. Many people do not attend concerts outside the school; so school concerts can plug the gap."

Panelists also noted results from the National Research Center of the Arts, an affiliate of the Harris polling organization. According to their survey, relatively few Americans attend concerts or operas regularly, although 64% agree that "a live performance is always better."[3]

Paul Lehman: "What this item says to me loud and clear is that Americans like music, almost without exception. Further, older individuals tend to feel more strongly about music than 9-year-olds."

Jo Ann Baird: "As individuals mature, they seem to like a broader range of music."

Charles Hoffer: "It might be worthwhile to point out that not every teen-age kid is running around gung-ho on rock. A majority of them—6 out of 10—do, but there are a lot of other interests at age 17."

In general, the panelists were impressed at the high percentages that claimed to enjoy art music more than any other type—5% for the 17-year-olds and 12% for the adults.

[3]National Research Center of the Arts, *Americans and the Arts: Highlights from a Survey of Public Opinion* (New York: Associated Council of the Arts, 1974), pp. 16-17.

EXERCISE 5D

How often do you attend live musical programs outside of school?

	Age Level		
	13	*17*	*Adult*
At least once a week	8%	5%	5%
A few times a month	8	15	4
Once a month	6	8	5
A few times a year	39	44	34
Once a year or less	38	28	53

EXERCISE 5E

Exercise 5E was administered individually to 9-year-olds, 13-year-olds, 17-year-olds and adults. Administrators read from and recorded responses on pages like the following.

A. Are there any kinds of music that you like to listen to?

		Age Level			
		9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
⬭	Yes (Go to B)	83%	96%	99%	99%
⬭	No (Go to D)	16	4	1	1
⬭	No response (After 10 seconds, go to D)	1	0	0	0

B.* What one kind of music do you MOST like to listen to?

_____

If no response is given in 10 seconds, go to D.

If respondent names more than one kind of music or says "ALL kinds" ask, *Which kind do you MOST like to listen to?* If respondent gives a general response such as "Popular" or "Classical," ask, *What TYPE of (popular, classical, etc.) music?* Probe to find out the specific kind of music such as rock, blues, opera, symphonic, etc. If respondent names a performer or composer, ask, *What kind of music do you MOST like by that person?*

Go to C.

	Age Level			
	9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
Instrumental art (e.g., classical, symphonic)	3%	4%	5%	12%
Vocal art (e.g., opera)	1	0	0	1
Jazz	4	5	4	6
Folk	4	2	4	5
Rock	32	57	62	14
Country-western	8	7	5	29
Soul	1	3	5	0
Popular ballads (e.g., barbershop, male vocalists, romantic)	2	2	2	8
Blues	1	1	2	2
Background music	0	0	0	3
Other popular	3	5	4	8
Other types (e.g., unclassifiable responses)	17	7	6	11

C. What other kinds of music do you like to listen to?

(1) _____ (6) _____

(2) _____ (7) _____

(3) _____ (8) _____

(4) _____ (9) _____

(5) _____ (10) _____

If respondent answers "None" OR no response is given in 10 seconds, go to D.

If respondent pauses after first response ask, *What other kinds do you like to listen to?* Probe to find out the specific kinds of music, as in B.

Stop after 10 responses OR when respondent answers "None" OR no response is given in 10 seconds.

	Age Level			
	9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
At least one additional type named	40%	73%	85%	92%
At least two additional types named	11	38	51	66
At least three additional types named	3	14	26	37

D. Are there any kinds of music that you do NOT like to listen to?

⬭	Yes (Go to E)	62	73	78	82
⬭	No (End the exercise)	36	26	22	18
⬭	No response (After 10 seconds, end the exercise)	2	1	0	0

E.* What one kind of music do you LEAST like to listen to?

_____

If no response is given in 10 seconds, end the exercise.

If respondent names more than one kind of music or says "ALL kinds," ask, *Which kind do you LEAST like to listen to?* If respondent gives a general response such as "Popular" or "Classical," ask, *What TYPE of (popular, classical, etc.) music?* Probe to find out the specific kind of music such as rock, blues, opera, symphonic, etc. If respondent names a performer or composer, ask, *What kind of music do you LEAST like by that person?*

Go to F.

	Age Level			
	9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
Instrumental art (e.g., classical, symphonic)	4%	9%	14%	9%
Vocal art (e.g., opera)	5	16	15	24
Jazz	2	4	4	7
Folk	2	3	2	1
Rock	8	7	11	25
Country-western	6	12	18	10
Soul	1	1	2	1
Popular ballads (e.g., barbershop, male vocalists, romantic)	4	3	1	0
Blues	1	1	2	1
Other popular	3	5	2	3
Other types (e.g., unclassifiable responses)	18	7	4	1

F. What other kinds of music do you NOT like to listen to?

(1) _____ (6) _____

(2) _____ (7) _____

(3) _____ (8) _____

(4) _____ (9) _____

(5) _____ (10) _____

If respondent answers "None" OR no response is given in 10 seconds, end the exercise.

If respondent pauses after first response ask, *What other kinds do you NOT like to listen to?* Probe to find out the specific kinds of music, as in E.

Stop after 10 responses OR when respondent answers "None" OR no response is given in 10 seconds.

	Age Level			
	9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
At least one additional type named	12%	33%	39%	49%
At least two additional types named	1	8	9	16
At least three additional types named	0	1	1	3

**Responses to parts B and E were categorized. Since some individuals did not respond to these parts, the column totals are less than the corresponding percentages of "yes" responses in parts A and D.*

Paul Lehman: "As you get older you learn a lot of different types of music. Of those additional kinds of music, perhaps the percentage of the kinds you like will increase because your tastes will broaden. But nonetheless, in absolute numbers, the number that you dislike will also increase. It will not increase as fast as the percentage that you like, but there will still be in absolute terms a greater number that you dislike simply because you know more."

The group was surprised at the low percentages that listed jazz as their first choice for listening, especially since individuals demonstrated some knowledge of jazz in Exercise 4K.[4]

Since the question called for free responses, the responses were categorized (into approximately 100 slots) by National Assessment. The figures in this report represent the combining of many categories. Paul Lehman advocated even more combining of categories: "I think the distinction over the years between country-western and folk has broken down quite a bit and is going to break down more. The same is probably true of rock and soul music."

Again, panelists pointed out that data from the National Research Center of the Arts corroborate assessment data.

In general, the panelists found it gratifying that the vast majority of individuals at all ages do enjoy singing. They noted that preferences for types of music seemed to parallel the preferences in Exercise 5E, but that more individuals preferred singing folk music than listening to it.

Charles Hoffer: "I think it is interesting that 9 and 13-year-olds have higher percentages than 17-year-olds and adults. It is also at these lower two ages that most individuals are still singing in the school."

[4] Exercise 4K and the national results can be seen in *A Perspective on the First Music Assessment, Music, Report 03-MU-02*, 1971-72 National Assessment of Music (Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1974), also based on comments from the MENC panelists.

Although most group data will be discussed in the following chapter, it should be noted that the panelists were particularly disturbed at the male-female differences on this exercise. At some ages, percentages that liked to sing very much were twice as high for girls as for boys:

	Age 9		*Age 13*	
	Male	*Female*	*Male*	*Female*
Like to sing very much	31%	50%	17%	42%
Like to sing somewhat	51	39	57	50
Do not like to sing	18	11	26	8

	Age 17		*Adult*	
	Male	*Female*	*Male*	*Female*
Like to sing very much	17%	33%	19%	35%
Like to sing somewhat	46	51	51	50
Do not like to sing	37	16	31	15

The large differences begin to occur at the 13-year-old level, when boys' voices change. Charles Hoffer pointed out that there is generally no vocal instruction after boys' voices change and suggested that instruction after voice change might radically alter attitudes.

EXERCISE 5F

Exercise 5F was also administered individually to 9-year-olds, 13-year-olds, 17-year-olds and adults. Administrators read from and recorded responses on pages like the following.

A. Do you like to sing?

		Age Level			
		9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
○	Very much (Go to B)	41%	30%	26%	27%
○	Somewhat (Go to B)	45	53	49	50
○	Not at all (Go to next exercise)	14	17	26	23
○	No response (After 10 seconds, go to next exercise)	0	0	0	0

B. Do you like to sing alone or with others?

○	Alone (Go to C)	11	11	17	16
○	With others (Go to C)	50	41	26	36
○	Both (Go to C)	25	31	31	25
○	No response (After 10 seconds, go to next exercise)	15	17	26	23

C.* What kind of music do you MOST like to sing?

If respondent answers "None" OR no response is given in 10 seconds, go to next exercise.

If respondent names more than one kind of music or says "ALL kinds" ask, *Which kind do you MOST like to sing?* If respondent gives a general response such as "Popular" or "Classical," ask, *What TYPE of (popular, classical, etc.) music?* Probe to find out the specific kind of music such as rock, blues, opera, symphonic, etc. If respondent names a performer or composer, ask, *What kind of music by that person do you MOST like to sing?*

Go to D.

	Age Level			
	9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
Art music (e.g., opera)	1%	1%	2%	3%
Jazz	2	3	1	1
Folk	7	5	8	10
Rock	20	40	36	9
Country-western	5	6	3	13
Soul	1	2	3	0
Popular ballads (e.g., barbershop, male vocalists, romantic)	1	2	2	12
Blues	0	1	2	1
Other popular	3	5	7	8
Other types (e.g., unclassifiable responses)	32	13	10	18

D.* What other kinds of music do you like to sing?

(1) _____ (6) _____

(2) _____ (7) _____

(3) _____ (8) _____

(4) _____ (9) _____

(5) _____ (10) _____

If respondent answers "None" OR no response is given in 10 seconds, go to next exercise.

If respondent pauses after first response ask, *What other kinds do you like to sing?* Probe to find out the specific kinds of music, as in C.

Stop after 10 responses OR when respondent answers "None" OR no response is given in 10 seconds.

	Age Level			
	9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
At least one additional type named	40%	62%	53%	66%
At least two additional types named	11	29	23	37

**Responses to parts C and D were categorized. Since some individuals did not respond to these parts, the column totals are less than the corresponding percentages of "yes" responses in parts A and B.*

The panelists were surprised at the great differences in results between Exercise 5G and performance Exercise 1L, which began with the question, "Do you now play a musical instrument?" Percentages of affirmative answers to the two exercises are displayed below:

	Age 9	*Age 13*	*Age 17*	*Adult*
Do you now play a musical instrument?	24%	33%	27%	16%
Can you play a musical instrument?	44	54	42	30

After studying the results of part B ("How often do you play?"), the group concluded that those who play once a year or less probably responded affirmatively to the "Can you play" question, negatively to the "Do you now play" question.

The percentages that play various instrument types (keyboard, folk, woodwind, brass, percussion, string) are identified in the performance report[5] and correlate closely

[5] *The First National Assessment of Musical Performance, Music, Report 03-MU-01,* 1971-72 National Assessment of Music (Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 1974), pp. 21-22.

EXERCISE 5G

Exercise 5G was also administered individually to 9-year-olds, 13-year-olds, 17-year-olds and adults. Administrators read from and recorded responses on pages like the following.

A. Can you play a musical instrument?

		Age Level 9	13	17	*Adult*
⬭	Yes (Go to B)	44%	54%	42%	30%
⬭	No (Go to G)	56	46	58	70
⬭	No response (After 10 seconds, go to G)	1	0	1	0

B. What instrument(s) do you play? How often do you play?

Name of Instrument?

How Often?
(Read all choices to respondent.)

	Every day	*A few times a week*	*Once a week*	*Once a month*	*Once a year or less*
(1) _____	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭
(2) _____	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭
(3) _____	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭
(4) _____	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭
(5) _____	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭

If respondent pauses after first response ask, *What other instruments can you play?*

Stop after 5 responses OR when respondent answers "None" OR no response is given in 10 seconds.

Go to C.

	Age Level			
	9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
Number instruments played				
At least one	44%	54%	42%	29%
At least two	11	20	17	12
At least three	3	6	7	5
At least four	1	2	3	2
Five	0	1	1	1
Instrument types				
Brass instrument named	3	9	6	5
Woodwind instrument named	5	13	9	4
Percussion instrument named	12	11	7	4
String instrument named	2	4	2	3
Keyboard instrument named	22	25	22	19
Folk instrument named	9	14	14	8
How often played				
Some instrument every day	19	24	15	2
Some instrument a few times a week	15	19	13	4
Some instrument once a week	10	10	8	4
Some instrument once a month	7	11	12	8
Some instrument once a year or less	3	10	12	20

C. (Ask for EACH instrument listed in part B.)

Do you like to play the *(Name of instrument)* very much, somewhat or not at all?

List instrument(s) on same line(s) as in B	*Very much*	*Some-what*	*Not at all*	*No re-sponse*	*None*
(1) _____	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭
(2) _____	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭
(3) _____	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭
(4) _____	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭
(5) _____	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭

If respondent says "Very Much" OR "Somewhat" for any instrument in C, go to D; otherwise, end the exercise.

	Age Level			
	9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
Very much	33%	36%	26%	18%
Somewhat	15	28	24	15
Not at all	2	4	4	4
No response	0	0	0	0

D. (Ask for EACH instrument marked "Very Much" OR "Somewhat" in C.)

Do you like to play the *(Name of instrument)* alone or with others?

List instrument(s) on same line(s) as in C

	Alone	*With others*	*Both*	*No response*	*Not asked or none*
(1) _____	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭
(2) _____	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭
(3) _____	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭
(4) _____	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭
(5) _____	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭	⬭

If respondent says "Alone," "With Others," OR "Both" for any instruments, go to E; otherwise end the exercise.

	Age Level			
	9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
Alone	19%	23%	20%	17%
With others	16	20	14	9
Both	14	23	18	8
No response	0	0	0	0

E.* What kind of music do you MOST like to play?

_____

If respondent answers "None" OR no response is given in 10 seconds, end the exercise.

If respondent names more than one kind of music or says "ALL kinds," ask, *Which kind do you most like to play?* If respondent gives a general response such as "Popular" or "Classical," ask, *What TYPE of (popular, classical, etc.) music?* Probe to find out the specific kind of music such as rock, blues, opera, symphonic, etc. If respondent names a performer or composer, ask, *What kind of music by that person do you MOST like to play?*

Go to F.

	Age Level			
	9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
Art music (e.g., classical, symphonies)	2%	5%	5%	7%
Jazz	2	3	2	2
Folk	4	3	3	2
Rock	6	17	12	1
Country-western	2	2	1	2
Soul	0	1	0	0
Other popular (e.g., ballads, background music)	3	8	6	7
Other types (e.g., unclassifiable responses)	17	9	7	6

F.* What other kinds of music do you like to play?

(1) _____ (6) _____

(2) _____ (7) _____

(3) _____ (8) _____

(4) _____ (9) _____

(5) _____ (10) _____

If respondent answers "None" OR no response is given in 10 seconds, end the exercise.

If respondent pauses after first response, ask, *What other kinds do you like to play?* Probe to find out the specific kinds of music, as in E.

After 10 responses OR when respondent answers "None" OR no response is given in 10 seconds, end the exercise.

	Age Level			
	9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
At least one additional type named	18%	38%	30%	23%
At least two additional types named	4	16	15	12

G. Would you like to learn how to play a music instrument?

○	Yes	49	32	44	47
○	No	6	11	13	20
○	I don't know.	1	2	2	3
○	No response (After 10 seconds, end the exercise)	0	0	0	0

**Responses to parts E and F were categorized. Since some individuals did not respond to these parts, the column totals are less than the corresponding percentages of "yes" responses in parts A, B, C, D and G.*

with information from the American Music Conference, which states that 22% play a piano, 16% play an organ, 12% play guitar, 3.5–5% play band instruments and 3.5% play string instruments.

Charles Hoffer and William English discussed these preferences.

Charles Hoffer: "Brass, woodwind and percussion instruments show a marked decrease with age; strings, on the other hand, are remarkedly consistent across ages. It's obvious that the string players stay with it."

Bill English: "Keyboard instruments are also remarkedly consistent across age."

Charles Hoffer: "Keyboard instruments can be played alone and perhaps that's the big difference. The other instruments need to be played with groups, and they drop off consistently. Perhaps string instruments are consistent because of the large number of community orchestras."

Bill English: "Conductors will beg string players to come and play, while they certainly won't beg a horn player to join."

Charles Hoffer: "It might also be important to point out that we've overrated the number of people who play guitar. At the highest age it's only probably 14%. Keyboards are definitely more popular."

The group also discussed the large difference between those who claim to play an instrument and those who say they would like to learn.

Bill English: "The results for the exercise that asks whether individuals would like to play musical instruments might be misleading. They might mean that, sure, they would like to play a musical instrument—if it came naturally and if they were offered one. Adults more than the other groups might realize the work involved in learning to play an instrument, and that might account for the lower percentages at that age level."

Jo Ann Baird: "These results nonetheless show the positive attitude toward music."

Bill English: "And it is true that in most school districts, you can't usually learn to play instruments at the high school level. If

you can't play an instrument by that time, you might as well forget it."

Paul Lehman: "There are a lot of people who would like to play instruments, who agree that playing instruments and singing are fun. We simply don't have the mechanism to teach them. If you want to start as a beginner, there are practically no high schools where you can do that. There is no opportunity to start if you don't start when the whole group starts and follow along in a lock-step pattern, joining bands, orchestras and so on."

Jo Ann Baird: "Even those who do play an instrument have few outlets after high school. I think these data imply quite clearly that music educators need to extend themselves into the community."

Charles Hoffer: "Not only is there a lack of availability and encouragement to join

EXERCISE 5H

For each of the four statements below fill in one oval which BEST describes how you feel about the statement.

	Age Level		
	13	*17*	*Adult*
A. Singing with a small group is enjoyable.			
⬭ Strongly agree	29%	34%	41%
⬭ Somewhat agree	47	47	42
⬭ Undecided	11	9	9
⬭ Somewhat disagree	9	8	6
⬭ Strongly disagree	3	2	2
B. Singing with a large group is enjoyable.			
⬭ Strongly agree	40	35	41
⬭ Somewhat agree	35	39	39
⬭ Undecided	10	10	10
⬭ Somewhat disagree	10	12	7
⬭ Strongly disagree	5	4	3
C. Playing an instrument in a small group is enjoyable.			
⬭ Strongly agree	31	37	31
⬭ Somewhat agree	30	30	28
⬭ Undecided	21	22	31
⬭ Somewhat disagree	12	7	5
⬭ Strongly disagree	7	4	5
D. Playing an instrument in a large group is enjoyable.			
⬭ Strongly agree	37	25	25
⬭ Somewhat agree	28	32	27
⬭ Undecided	18	25	33
⬭ Somewhat disagree	11	12	9
⬭ Strongly disagree	7	6	6

musical groups after high school, but many instruments have to be turned back to the school when one graduates."

Charles Hoffer: "Maybe we have been trying to play hard ball, where we should be trying to play slow pitch softball. We might need activities of a less demanding nature, so the adult who plays two or three times a week can at least play with satisfaction without feeling foolish. A lot of people avoid music groups because they feel they are not good enough to join."

Paul Lehman: "There are not enough options now. There should be small groups, groups for people who don't play too often, and so on."

Paul Lehman: "In every case, those who strongly agree and somewhat agree with these statements are a majority, in some cases an overwhelming majority. Even in the case of playing an instrument in a large group, the majority agreed that it was enjoyable."

Positive as these results might seem, the panelists were concerned by the less positive attitude toward playing an instrument in a large group. The group attempted to identify some reasons that might account for these lower percentages, but was unable to agree on any.

Jo Ann Baird broadened the perspective by pointing out that large groups in general were less popular: "There seems to be a growing interest in small group participation as opposed to large group participation according to these figures. And yet we seem to be pushing large groups in the schools."

Charles Hoffer: "We have to do that in order to maintain classes, or we lose them because of the low pupil-teacher ratio."

EXERCISE 51

Exercise 51 was administered individually to 9-year-olds, 13-year-olds, 17-year-olds and adults. Administrators read from and recorded responses on pages like the following.

A. Do you now belong to a chorus, a choir, a singing group or a vocal group?

		Age Level			
		9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
○	Yes (Go to B)	22%	27%	20%	5%
○	No (Go to C)	77	73	80	94
○	No response (After 10 seconds, go to C)	0	0	1	0

B.* What kind of group(s) are they?

(1) _____ (6) _____

(2) _____ (7) _____

(3) _____ (8) _____

(4) _____ (9) _____

(5) _____ (10) _____

If no response is given in 10 seconds, go to C.

Probe to find out the particular kind of group. For example, if respondent says "Choir" ask, *What kind of choir?* Examples of desired responses are "church choir," "school choir," etc. If respondent pauses after first response ask, *What other groups do you belong to?*

Stop after 10 responses OR when respondent answers "None" OR no response is given in 10 seconds.

Go to C.

	Age Level			
	9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
Large, school vocal group	9%	17%	12%	0%
Small, school vocal group	1	1	1	0
Large, community vocal group	12	11	9	4
Small, community vocal group	1	1	2	1

C. Do you now belong to a band, orchestra, or other instrumental group?

⬭	Yes (Go to D)	8	17	10	1
⬭	No (Go to next exercise)	92	82	89	99
⬭	No response (After 10 seconds, go to next exercise)	0	1	1	0

D.* What kind of group(s) are they?

(1) _____ (6) _____

(2) _____ (7) _____

(3) _____ (8) _____

(4) _____ (9) _____

(5) _____ (10) _____

If no response is given in 10 seconds, go to next exercise.

Probe to find out the particular kind of group. For example, if respondent says "Band" ask, *What kind of band?* Examples of desired responses are "rock band," "school orchestra," etc. If respondent pauses after first response ask, *What other groups do you belong to?*

Stop after 10 responses OR when respondent answers "None" OR no response is given in 10 seconds.

	Age Level			
	9	*13*	*17*	*Adult*
Large, school instrumental group	6%	14%	8%	0%
Small, school instrumental group	1	1	1	0
Large, community instrumental group	1	1	1	0
Small, community instrumental group	1	3	2	1
Yes to both A and C	4	5	3	0
Yes to A, No to C	19	22	16	5
No to A, Yes to C	4	12	7	1

**Responses to parts B and D were categorized. Since some individuals did not respond to these parts, the column totals are less than the corresponding percentages of "yes" responses in parts A and C.*

Participation in both vocal and instrumental groups decreases considerably at the upper ages, especially at the adult level. Results from the National Research Center of the Arts (NRCA) indicate that many adults would like to join a group, but, for one reason or another, fail to do so. According to the NRCA, 10% sing in a choir or other group, 10% more would like to, 3% play in an orchestra or other group and 7% more would like to.[6]

Jo Ann Baird: "Community choral groups seem to receive more participation than community instrumental groups, but there are more vehicles, such as church choirs, for vocal participation."

---

[6]National Research Center of the Arts, *Americans and the Arts: Highlights From a Survey of Public Opinion*, p. 10.

CHAPTER 2
GROUP DIFFERENCES

Males are less interested in music and are less actively involved, especially in vocal performance. These less positive male attitudes can be attributed to a number of factors, including the predominance of women in elementary music education, the failure to continue vocal instruction after the voice change, competition from athletic programs, and an ambiguous cultural attitude toward males in the arts.

In addition to obtaining national percentages for the various exercises in the music packages, National Assessment obtains results for groups in various geographical regions, of different sexes, of different races, with differing amounts of parental education and from different types of communities. This chapter will present information about how individuals from these various subpopulations compare to the nation as a whole on the various attitude exercises.

The results are first presented graphically, then highlighted and discussed by the MENC panelists. Since the tables are somewhat unusual, the chapter will begin with a short explanation, using the regional exhibit as an example.

Each table begins by listing the exercise or exercise part to be analyzed. First is Exercise 5A, part 1: How often do you seek out and listen to music that you like to hear on television? Percentages for each age level that claimed to listen to music at least once a week are given in column three. Differences by region are given in columns four, five, six and seven. By adding the differences to the national percentage, the regional percentages can be obtained. For example, the percentage of 9-year-olds in the Northeast that listen to music on television at least weekly is 91.7% + −0.4 = 91.3%. For Southeastern 9-year-olds, the percentage is 91.7% + 1.9 = 93.6%. Differences that are statistically significant ($p < .05$) are indicated by asterisks.

Region

National Assessment identifies four regions of the country, the Northeast, the Southeast, the West and the Central region each defined by the map below.

Although there are relatively large regional differences in some of the subject areas National Assessment studies, geography does not account for large differences in attitudes toward music.

The Southeast accounted for some of the most noticeable differences. Since percentages for the Southeast have often been lower than the national level in other subject areas, it is noteworthy that the group performed above the national level on many of the attitude exercises. The group seems to listen to more music, enjoy more music, and sing more music. However, they lagged somewhat behind the nation in playing instruments and joining instrumental groups.

The Northeast, which in other areas tends to attain higher percentages than the nation as a whole, fell behind in the music attitude items. The panelists suggested that this lag might be due to the pre-university orientation of Northeastern public schools, where music is not considered part of the core curriculum.

The Central and Western regions, the panel concluded, both demonstrate percentages close to the national level. The Central region claims more instrumentalists than other regions of the country.

Description	Age	National Percentage	Northeast Difference	Southeast Difference	Central Difference	West Difference
5A						
Listen to music on TV at least weekly						
	9	91.7	−0.4	1.9	1.9	−3.4*
	13	79.7	−3.3	6.9*	0.3	−4.1*
	17	71.8	−7.3*	8.3*	0.0	0.1
	Adult	63.4	−3.8*	3.8	2.9	−3.0
Listen to music on radio at least weekly						
	9	81.4	0.1	−0.1	1.7	−1.9
	13	92.2	1.9*	−0.4	−0.7	−0.6
	17	97.6	−0.6	0.1	0.2	0.2
	Adult	92.2	−1.1	−1.1	0.4	1.5*
Listen to music on records/tapes at least weekly						
	9	68.3	2.7	4.2*	−1.5	−5.0*
	13	76.1	1.0	0.5	0.8	−2.7*
	17	85.2	1.9	1.1	−2.9*	0.6
	Adult	63.7	4.9*	−1.3	−3.9*	1.0
5D						
Attend live musical programs at least monthly						
	13	23.2	−2.0	9.2*	−2.5	−3.1*
	17	27.7	−2.8	5.3*	−2.0	0.3
	Adult	13.6	0.7	2.1	−3.3*	1.2
5E						
Like to listen to at least one kind of music						
	9	76.2	−6.7*	8.8*	4.6*	−6.8*
	13	93.4	0.5	−0.8	1.4	−1.4
	17	98.0	0.0	0.5	−0.3	−0.1
	Adult	98.5	−0.9	−0.5	0.9*	0.3
5F						
Like to sing at least one kind of music						
	9	73.6	−2.3	5.6*	2.5	−5.8*
	13	79.2	−3.1*	3.4*	2.7	−3.4*
	17	72.6	−4.2*	4.9*	−0.1	0.3
	Adult	76.7	−5.9*	0.8	4.8*	−0.6
5G						
Play at least one instrument						
	9	43.7	5.3*	−3.1	−1.1	−1.1
	13	54.0	−2.6	−4.4*	3.0*	2.9
	17	41.6	−3.3	−3.1*	6.5*	−1.1
	Adult	29.5	−1.0	−3.7	1.2	2.7*

Description	Age	National Percentage	Northeast Difference	Southeast Difference	Central Difference	West Difference
5H						
Enjoy singing with a small group						
	13	75.8	−3.8*	2.2	0.8	0.4
	17	80.8	−1.2	4.9*	−1.0	−2.1
	Adult	82.8	−1.4	−1.6	2.1*	0.2
Enjoy singing with a large group						
	13	74.8	−4.0	−0.5	2.2	1.6
	17	74.1	−1.1	5.2*	−1.4	−2.1
	Adult	79.7	−2.0	−1.1	0.6	2.1
Enjoy playing with a small instrumental group						
	13	60.1	−1.3	1.1	−0.8	1.0
	17	66.9	−2.5	1.5	−2.0	3.3
	Adult	59.0	−1.2	−0.9	−2.4	4.7*
Enjoy playing with a large instrumental group						
	13	64.2	−3.8*	4.0*	−0.3	0.5
	17	57.0	−6.8*	3.8*	−1.9	5.4*
	Adult	52.0	3.0*	−4.7*	−0.4	1.6
5I						
Belong to at least one vocal group						
	9	22.1	0.7	1.8	−3.7*	1.8
	13	26.3	−6.0*	4.1	5.1*	−4.2*
	17	19.7	−4.9*	8.5*	−0.8	−1.7
	Adult	4.8	−0.7	2.3*	−0.4	−0.8
Belong to at least one instrumental group						
	9	7.8	3.4*	−2.1*	−1.2	−0.2
	13	16.6	−2.5*	−1.7	1.1	3.0*
	17	9.8	−0.3	0.2	2.7*	−2.9*
	Adult	0.8	0.0	0.0	0.3	−0.3

Sex

Females of all ages generally demonstrated more positive attitudes toward music than did their male counterparts. Males, it appears, are less interested in music and are less actively involved, especially in vocal performance.

Panelists attributed the less positive male attitudes to a number of factors, including the predominance of women in elementary music education, the failure to continue vocal instruction after the voice change, competition from athletic programs and an ambiguous cultural attitude toward males in the arts.

Description	*Age*	*National Percentage*	*Male Difference*	*Female Difference*
5A				
Listen to music on TV at least weekly	9	91.7	0.0	0.0
	13	79.7	−3.2*	3.0*
	17	71.8	−1.0	1.0
	Adult	63.4	−2.7*	2.6*
Listen to music on radio at least weekly	9	81.4	−2.4*	2.4*
	13	92.2	−2.1*	1.9*
	17	97.6	−0.2	0.2
	Adult	92.2	1.0*	−1.0*
Listen to music on records/tapes at least weekly	9	68.3	−2.0*	2.0
	13	76.1	−5.3*	4.9*
	17	85.2	0.6	−0.6
	Adult	63.7	−4.0*	3.8*
5D				
Attend live musical programs at least monthly	13	23.2	1.0	−1.0
	17	27.7	1.2	−1.2
	Adult	13.6	0.5	−0.5
5E				
Like to listen to at least one kind of music	9	76.2	−2.8*	2.6*
	13	93.4	−1.4*	1.3*
	17	98.0	0.1	−0.1
	Adult	98.5	0.5*	−0.4*
5F				
Like to sing at least one kind of music	9	73.6	−3.2*	2.9*
	13	79.2	−8.9*	8.6*
	17	72.6	−11.2*	9.9*
	Adult	76.7	−8.2*	7.9*

Description	Age	National Percentage	Male Difference	Female Difference
5G				
Play at least one instrument	9	43.7	−4.2*	4.2*
	13	54.0	−4.8*	4.9*
	17	41.6	−2.5*	2.4*
	Adult	29.5	−3.1*	3.0*
5H				
Enjoy singing with a small group	13	75.8	−6.6*	7.0*
	17	80.8	−9.1*	8.9*
	Adult	82.8	−4.7*	4.6*
Enjoy singing with a large group	13	74.8	−5.6*	5.9*
	17	74.1	−11.3*	11.1*
	Adult	79.7	−6.8*	6.5*
Enjoy playing with a small instrumental group	13	60.1	1.8*	−1.9*
	17	66.9	3.0*	−3.0*
	Adult	59.0	0.0	0.0
Enjoy playing with a large instrumental group	13	64.2	−3.0*	3.2*
	17	57.0	−3.0*	3.0*
	Adult	52.0	−2.0	2.0
5I				
Belong to at least one vocal group	9	22.1	−6.3*	5.8*
	13	26.3	−9.4*	9.5*
	17	19.7	−8.6*	7.8*
	Adult	4.8	−1.5*	1.5*
Belong to at least one instrumental group	9	7.8	−0.7	0.6
	13	16.6	1.4	−1.4
	17	9.8	1.2	−1.0
	Adult	0.8	0.3	−0.3

Sample size permits the assessment to study the performance of only two racial groups, Blacks and Whites. Other minority groups, such as Native Americans, Mexican-Americans and Oriental-Americans, are classified as "other" and are not included in this analysis.

Black attitudes toward music were much more positive than those of their White counterparts. Blacks listen to music on the media more often than Whites, attend musical programs much more often than Whites, enjoy participation in music more than Whites. Blacks join vocal groups more often than Whites but, probably because of economic factors, play instruments less often. The group suggested that schools in poorer areas, not those in affluent areas, should provide instruments for the students' use.

Panelists suggested that these large differences might be the result of a greater emphasis on music in the Black subculture. Many Blacks, they theorized, might use music as a means of social identification.

Description	*Age*	*National Percentage*	*Black Difference*	*White Difference*
5A				
Listen to music on TV at least weekly	9	91.7	−1.7	1.1*
	13	79.7	11.7*	−2.2*
	17	71.8	14.0*	−2.9*
	Adult	63.4	10.8*	−2.3*
Listen to music on radio at least weekly	9	81.4	−2.4*	2.4*
	13	92.2	0.7	−0.1
	17	97.6	0.2	−0.1
	Adult	92.2	3.5*	−0.5*
Listen to music on records/tapes at least weekly	9	68.3	5.8*	−0.6
	13	76.1	12.2*	−1.8*
	17	85.2	4.0*	−0.7*
	Adult	63.7	11.6*	−1.2*
5D				
Attend live musical programs at least monthly	13	23.2	24.3*	−3.6*
	17	27.7	13.7*	−2.1*
	Adult	13.6	13.1*	−1.9*
5E				
Like to listen to at least one kind of music	9	76.2	3.4	0.9
	13	93.4	−3.2*	1.2*
	17	98.0	0.8	0.0
	Adult	98.5	−1.3	0.2

Description	*Age*	*National Percentage*	*Black Difference*	*White Difference*
5F				
Like to sing at least one kind of music	9	73.6	−0.9	1.8*
	13	79.2	4.4	0.5
	17	72.6	10.2*	−1.0*
	Adult	76.7	5.6*	0.1
5G				
Play at least one instrument	9	43.7	−1.3	0.9
	13	54.0	−6.7*	1.4*
	17	41.6	−8.5*	2.0*
	Adult	29.5	−9.0*	1.7*
5H				
Enjoy singing with a small group	13	75.8	−4.8*	0.5
	17	80.8	5.3*	−0.9*
	Adult	82.8	−4.5*	0.2
Enjoy singing with a large group	13	74.8	−5.6*	0.8*
	17	74.1	2.1	0.1
	Adult	79.7	−7.7*	1.0
Enjoy playing with a small instrumental group	13	60.1	−2.8	0.4
	17	66.9	−1.0	−0.7
	Adult	59.0	8.1*	−1.6*
Enjoy playing with a large instrumental group	13	64.2	0.7	−0.5
	17	57.0	9.5*	−2.3*
	Adult	52.0	3.4	−1.0*
5I				
Belong to at least one vocal group	9	22.1	11.7*	−2.0*
	13	26.3	11.7*	−1.1*
	17	19.7	14.7*	−1.3*
	Adult	4.8	6.1*	−0.5
Belong to at least one instrumental group	9	7.8	−1.3	0.1
	13	16.6	−2.5	0.8*
	17	9.8	−1.3	0.6*
	Adult	0.8	0.1	0.0

Parental Education

The assessment identifies four parental education groups: individuals whose parents have no high school education, those who have at least one parent with some high school education, those who have at least one parent who graduated from high school but failed to continue his formal education, and those with a parent who has some post high school education. Since the groups tend to show a stepwise progression, we have included differences for only the two extreme groups in the following analysis.

Although the groups demonstrated little difference in their willingness to listen to music, there were large differences in attitudes involving active participation. More members of the post high school group enjoyed singing and playing and were willing to participate in musical groups. Differences in the percentage that were able to play instruments were the greatest, though the interpretation of these results is complicated by economic factors.

Description	*Age*	*National Percentage*	*No High School Difference*	*Post High School Difference*
5A				
Listen to music on TV at least weekly	9	91.7	−1.5	0.6
	13	79.7	7.4*	−7.5*
	17	71.8	10.4*	−7.3*
	Adult	63.4	11.6*	−14.0*
Listen to music on radio at least weekly	9	81.4	4.2	0.8
	13	92.2	−2.7	0.3
	17	97.6	0.0	0.1
	Adult	92.2	0.0	−0.7
Listen to music on records/tapes at least weekly	9	68.3	4.4	−2.0
	13	76.1	−1.9	0.6
	17	85.2	−4.9*	1.0
	Adult	63.7	−2.7	4.9*
5D				
Attend live musical programs at least monthly	13	23.2	6.9*	−1.3
	17	27.7	−1.5	0.2
	Adult	13.6	1.2	4.3*
5E				
Like to listen to at least one kind of music	9	76.2	−0.6	4.2*
	13	93.4	−8.9*	4.2*
	17	98.0	−0.6	0.4
	Adult	98.5	−0.6	0.9*
5F				
Like to sing at least one kind of music	9	73.6	−6.7	1.9
	13	79.2	−6.5	0.8
	17	72.6	−3.0	2.9*
	Adult	76.7	−1.6	−0.6

Description	*Age*	*National Percentage*	*No High School Difference*	*Post High School Difference*
5G				
Play at least one instrument	9	43.7	−19.4*	12.2*
	13	54.0	−20.9*	9.0*
	17	41.6	−15.5*	9.4*
	Adult	29.5	−13.1*	16.1*
5H				
Enjoy singing with a small group	13	75.8	−5.9*	2.4*
	17	80.8	3.2	0.6
	Adult	82.2	−0.7	0.0
Enjoy singing with a large group	13	74.8	−3.7	3.9*
	17	74.1	−3.8	2.6*
	Adult	79.7	−5.1*	3.9*
Enjoy playing with a small instrumental group	13	60.1	−7.5*	0.0
	17	66.9	−5.6*	3.2*
	Adult	59.0	−0.8	−0.6
Enjoy playing with a large instrumental group	13	64.2	1.2	−0.1
	17	57.0	2.3	2.2
	Adult	52.0	−3.6*	3.3*
5I				
Belong to at least one vocal group	9	22.1	−2.7	2.1
	13	26.3	−1.2	3.7*
	17	19.7	−6.1*	3.7*
	Adult	4.8	−0.6	0.4
Belong to at least one instrumental group	9	7.8	−2.9*	2.4*
	13	16.6	−8.8*	4.0*
	17	9.8	−5.9*	4.0*
	Adult	0.8	−0.3	0.3

Community Type

Although National Assessment identifies seven community types, we have found that three differ most dramatically from the nation as a whole: rural communities, where the majority of adults work on farms; low metropolitan or inner city areas, where the majority of adults are on welfare; and high metropolitan, largely suburban areas, where the majority of adults are in professional or managerial positions. Only results for these three community types are displayed in the exhibit below.[1]

Differences by community type are not as large as in other subject areas assessed. The two most noticeable differences are the increased playing of instruments in the high metro areas and the increased participation in musical groups, especially vocal groups, in the rural areas. Other differences do not appear to be noteworthy.

[1] Results for the other community types—small places, medium size cities, big cities and urban fringe areas—are presented in *The First Music Assessment: A Statistical Report, Music, Report 03-MU-20* (in press).

Description	*Age*	*National Percentage*	*High Metro Difference*	*Low Metro Difference*	*Rural Difference*
5A					
Listen to music on TV at least weekly	9	91.7	−2.2	−2.5	−1.9
	13	79.7	−8.0*	11.3*	1.2
	17	71.8	−13.8*	11.9*	8.8*
	Adult	63.4	−16.7*	9.7*	13.2*
Listen to music on radio at least weekly	9	81.4	−1.0	5.3*	−3.8
	13	92.2	3.6*	0.6	−3.0
	17	97.6	−0.6	−0.1	1.2*
	Adult	92.2	−0.4	0.4	−5.0*
Listen to music on records/tapes at least weekly	9	68.3	−3.8	4.0	3.4
	13	76.1	0.4	8.7*	−4.7*
	17	85.2	4.5*	3.6*	−4.5
	Adult	63.7	3.6	9.7	−3.6
5D					
Attend live musical programs at least monthly	13	23.2	−7.8*	10.4*	7.2*
	17	27.7	−3.7	3.1	−7.4*
	Adult	13.6	6.1*	6.3*	−4.8
5E					
Like to listen to at least one kind of music	9	76.2	2.0	−4.7	−3.5
	13	93.4	2.5*	−4.7*	−0.4
	17	98.0	0.9	−1.0	1.4*
	Adult	98.5	1.2*	−0.4	−0.6

Description	*Age*	*National Percentage*	*High Metro Difference*	*Low Metro Difference*	*Rural Difference*
5F					
Like to sing at least one kind of music	9	73.6	−3.1	−2.5	−0.7
	13	79.2	−2.6	−2.6	4.8
	17	72.6	−1.1	6.4*	−3.4*
	Adult	76.7	−3.9	1.8	4.3*
5G					
Play at least one instrument	9	43.7	7.9*	−1.3	−2.0
	13	54.0	7.6*	−7.2*	−7.1*
	17	41.6	3.5	−11.3*	−0.7
	Adult	29.5	7.9*	−8.6*	−1.1
5H					
Enjoy singing with a small group	13	75.8	−2.4	−4.3	1.0
	17	80.8	−2.8	4.2*	2.8
	Adult	82.8	−1.9	−3.1	0.2
Enjoy singing with a large group	13	74.8	7.5*	−4.9	2.2
	17	74.1	−3.0	2.1	−5.2
	Adult	79.7	0.3	−6.0	−0.8
Enjoy playing with a small instrumental group	13	60.1	−1.2	2.3	−2.8
	17	66.9	6.7*	5.0	−5.6*
	Adult	59.0	−2.9	5.7*	−2.6
Enjoy playing with a large instrumental group	13	64.2	−2.3	−2.8	7.2*
	17	57.0	0.9	6.6*	−2.6
	Adult	52.0	−0.6	10.1*	−3.1
5I					
Belong to at least one vocal group	9	22.1	−0.6	2.8	2.1
	13	26.3	−2.4	−3.3	15.4*
	17	19.7	−5.9*	−2.4	7.2*
	Adult	4.8	1.0	0.9	−0.1
Belong to at least one instrumental group	9	7.8	6.1*	0.7	−5.0*
	13	16.6	−4.7*	−1.0	9.3*
	17	9.8	−0.4	−2.3	3.3
	Adult	0.8	1.1*	−0.3	0.3

CHAPTER 3
CONCLUSIONS

Drawing conclusions from a variety of data is a difficult task. One conclusion is always that more research is needed to confirm or clarify what is implied by present data; that while these data are useful, other data would be even more useful. Between long silences, the following were some of the other conclusions—however tentative—drawn by the MENC panelists.

Charles Hoffer: "In just about all the music exercises, we saw a generally favorable attitude toward music and music activities."

Paul Lehman: "Musical tastes are not terribly narrow either. The majority of individuals at the upper ages listed several kinds of music that they enjoyed listening to and singing."

Charles Hoffer: "Rock is, as we suspected, the youth music, while nonrock music appeals much more to the adults. But tastes are broader than such a statement would imply."

Dick Graham: "Almost all Americans of all ages do seek out and listen to some music that they enjoy, and more than half attend a live musical concert at least once a year."

Charles Hoffer: "The 13-year-olds and 17-year-olds do, however, 'listen' to music more than the other age groups."

Paul Lehman: "It is also true that from one third to one half of the population play musical instruments. And that's a pretty high percentage."

William English: "Despite the fact that many adults can't play musical instruments, we can't use this as a measure of their lack of musical sensitivity."

Jo Ann Baird: "Similarly, many members of our society are not interested in singing themselves; but this doesn't mean that they're not interested in music."

William English: "Our goal is musical sensitivity. Now, we are pleased with the high percentages that reflect approach tendencies, but the more important question like 'What did it do for you?' or 'How did it make you feel?' were not asked. Those questions reflect our ultimate goals."

Jo Ann Baird: "I do think these results have tremendous implication for curriculum

We seem to have a kind of masochistic tendency to believe that we are turning kids off to music. I read such conclusions in so many articles. I think these data show that, it's true, we might not have taught the kid very much, but at least we haven't turned him off to music.

development in music, and I do think they might have implications for the responsibility of music educators toward the society. These data do corroborate certain conceptions we already have. For example, people don't go on playing their instruments after they get out of school."

William English: "Well, then, maybe we should be teaching different kinds of instruments. People seem to prefer playing by themselves or in small groups. We should include piano classes and guitar classes in high school and encourage chamber music."

Paul Lehman: "Most instrumental programs—and vocal programs, too—are based on large ensembles. Right now, small ensemble programs are kind of incidental: members of the large orchestra get together after school to play a few other pieces of music. But the small ensemble programs ought to be a lot stronger; perhaps that's even where the emphasis ought to be. We would have a lot more flexibility and a lot more potential carry over with this kind of program."

Charles Hoffer: "Music educators seem to have a kind of masochistic tendency to believe that we are turning kids off to music. I read such conclusions in so many articles. I think these data show that, it's true, we might not have taught the kid very much, but at least we haven't turned him off to music."

Paul Lehman: "It also looks as though opera as an institution needs to hire a good PR firm."

These comments, the panel felt, reflect only a fraction of the implications from the data. The two-day conference could not adequately allow for reviewing, digesting and integrating the data.

The MENC panel agreed that the data gathered by National Assessment provide a new perspective from which to evaluate the quality of music education in America. Previous evaluations have been based on limited observations, often specially selected to support a theory. Assessment data, on the other hand, were drawn from a random, stratified national sample of individuals and cover a broad range of musical behaviors. Such data represent an important beginning in the effort to secure objective data for educational decision making.

ADDITIONAL MUSIC PUBLICATIONS FROM NATIONAL ASSESSMENT

The First National Assessment of Musical Performance presents an item-by-item account of the performance of 9, 13, 17 and 26-35 year-olds in singing familiar songs, repeating unfamiliar musical material, improvising, performing from notation and performing a prepared piece. Music professionals from all over the country constructed the scoring guidelines.

The First Music Assessment: An Overview summarizes results from all five areas of the Music assessment: performance, musical notation and terminology, instrumental and vocal media, music history and literature and attitudes toward music.

The Music Assessment: A Statistical Report will present complete data for all released Music exercises.

A Perspective on the First Music Assessment identifies the implications of the assessment for teachers of music. The report was prepared with the cooperation of the Music Educators National Conference.

Music Objectives explains the objectives of music educators, as compiled by music professionals. The exercises in the first Music assessment were based on these objectives.

Music Cassette. To supplement the printed reports, National Assessment has produced a 60-minute cassette explaining scoring criteria for performance exercises and presenting musical stimuli used in the nonperformance exercises. The cassette is available for $2 from National Assessment at the address shown below.

NATIONAL ASSESSMENT OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRESS
A Project of the Education Commission of the States
Suite 300
1860 Lincoln Street
Denver, Colorado 80203

☆ U.S. GOVERNMENT PRINTING OFFICE 1974 - 678-388/42 REG. 8

Education Commission of the States

NATIONAL ASSESSMENT
OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRESS

MUSIC
REPORT 03-MU-03
1971-72 ASSESSMENT

A Project of The Education Commission of the States

BEST COPY AVAILABLE